Forensic Science Commission

Dr. Jeffrey Barnard, Chair

Phone: 1-512-936-0770 Fax: 1-512-936-7986

E-mail: info@fsc.texas.gov

# TEXAS FORENSIC SCIENCE COMMISSION

# **POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

**ADOPTED MAY 3, 2019** 

### 1.0 Texas Forensic Science Commission ("FSC" or "Commission")

The investigative mission of the FSC is to strengthen the use of forensic science in Texas by conducting thorough and fair investigations, encouraging forensic development, and recommending legislative improvements.<sup>1</sup> The Commission is also responsible for accrediting crime laboratories and licensing forensic analysts (effective January 1, 2019). The licensing and accreditation programs are summarized in Sections 5 and 6 of these Policies and Procedures. Because the Commission has rulemaking authority with respect to these programs, interested parties should consult the Commission's administrative rules for details and current information on licensing and accreditation.

#### 1.1 Investigative Duties

- (a) The FSC is charged by statute to:
  - (1) develop and implement a reporting system through which crime laboratories may report professional negligence or professional misconduct;
  - (2) require crime laboratories that conduct forensic analyses to report professional negligence or professional misconduct to the Commission <sup>2</sup>;
  - (3) investigate, in a timely manner, any allegation of professional negligence or professional misconduct that would substantially affect the integrity of the results of a forensic analysis conducted by a crime laboratory; and
  - (4) initiate for educational purposes investigations of forensic analyses without receiving a complaint where the Commission determines by majority vote of a quorum of the members that an investigation of the forensic analysis would advance the integrity and reliability of forensic science in Texas.<sup>3</sup>
- **(b)** An investigation under Subsection (a)(3):
  - (1) must include the preparation of a written report that identifies and also describes the methods and procedures used to identify:
    - (A) the alleged negligence or misconduct;
    - (B) whether negligence or misconduct occurred;
    - (C) any corrective action required of the laboratory, facility, or entity;
    - (D) observations of the Commission regarding the integrity and reliability of forensic analysis conducted;
    - (E) best practices identified by the Commission during the course of the investigation; and
    - (F) other relevant recommendations, as determined by the Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Texas Legislature created the FSC during the 79<sup>th</sup> Legislative Session by passing House Bill 1068 (the "Act"). The Act amended the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure to add Article 38.01, which describes the composition and authority of the Commission. *See* Act of May 30, 2005, 79<sup>th</sup> Leg., R.S., ch. 1224, § 1, 2005. During the 83<sup>rd</sup> and 84<sup>th</sup> Sessions, the Legislature further amended the Code of Criminal Procedure to clarify and expand the Commission's jurisdictional authority. *See* Acts 2013, 83<sup>rd</sup> Leg. ch. 782 (S.B. 1238), §§ 1 to 4, eff. June 14, 2013; Acts 2015, 84<sup>th</sup> Leg., ch. 1276 (S.B. 1287), §§ 1 to 7, eff. September 1, 2015, (except Tex. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(b) which takes effect January 1, 2019). These written policies and procedures are intended to consolidate a description of the Commission's authority and provide a guide for the consistent exercise of the discretion and authority of the FSC.

<sup>2</sup> *See* FSC Crime Laboratory Disclosure Guidelines attached as Appendix A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(a).

- (2) It may include one or more:
  - (A) retrospective reexaminations of other forensic analyses conducted by the laboratory, facility, or entity that may involve the same kind of negligence or misconduct; and
  - (B) follow-up evaluations of the laboratory, facility, or entity to review:
    - (i) the implementation of any corrective action required under Subdivision (1)(C); or
    - (ii) the conclusion of any retrospective reexamination under Paragraph (2)(A).<sup>4</sup>
- (c) If the Commission conducts an investigation of an unaccredited crime laboratory or the investigation is conducted pursuant to an allegation involving a forensic method or discipline that is not an accredited field of forensic science, or the investigation is initiated by the Commission for educational purposes, any resulting investigative report must be limited to:
  - (A) observations of the Commission regarding the integrity and reliability of the forensic analysis conducted;
  - (B) best practices identified by the Commission during the course of the investigation; or
  - (C) other relevant recommendations, as determined by the Commission.<sup>5</sup>
- (d) The Commission by contract may delegate the duties described by subsections (a)(3) and (a)(4) above.
- (e) The Commission may require that a crime laboratory investigated under (a)(3) or (a)(4) pay any costs incurred to ensure compliance with (b) and (c) above.
- **(f)** The Commission shall make all investigation reports completed under subsections (b) and (c) available to the public. A report completed under subsections (b) or (c), in a subsequent civil or criminal proceeding, is not prima facie evidence of the information or findings contained in the report.
- **(g)** The Commission may not make a determination of professional negligence or professional misconduct unless the allegation or laboratory disclosure concerns an accredited forensic discipline *and* an accredited crime laboratory.
- **(h)** The Commission may not issue a finding related to the guilt or innocence of a party in an underlying civil or criminal trial involving conduct investigated by the Commission.
- (i) The Commission may review and refer cases that are the subject of an investigation to the Office of Capital and Forensic Writs in accordance with Section 78.054(b), Government Code.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(b-1).

#### 1.2 Definitions

"Accredited field of forensic science" means a specific forensic method or methodology validated or approved by the Commission under Article 38.01, Code of Criminal Procedure § 4-d as part of the accreditation process for crime laboratories.<sup>6</sup>

"Commission" means the Texas Forensic Science Commission.

"Criminal action" means an investigation, complaint, arrest, bail, bond, trial, appeal, punishment, or other matter related to conduct proscribed by a criminal offense.<sup>8</sup>

"Crime Laboratory" has the meaning assigned by Article 38.35, Code of Criminal Procedure.9

"Forensic analysis" has the meaning assigned by. Article 38.35, Code of Criminal Procedure. 10

"Physical evidence" means any tangible object, thing, or substance relating to a criminal action. 11

"Professional Misconduct" means the forensic analyst or crime laboratory through a material act or omission, deliberately failed to follow a standard of practice that an ordinary forensic analyst or crime laboratory would have followed, and the deliberate act or omission would substantially affect the integrity of the results of a forensic analysis. An act or omission was deliberate if the forensic analyst or crime laboratory was aware of and consciously disregarded an accepted standard of practice.

"Professional Negligence" means the forensic analyst or crime laboratory, through a material act or omission, negligently failed to follow the standard of practice that an ordinary forensic analyst or crime laboratory would have followed, and the negligent act or omission would substantially affect the integrity of the results of a forensic analysis. An act or omission was negligent if the forensic analyst or crime laboratory should have been but was not aware of an accepted standard of practice.

- (1) For purposes of these definitions, the term "standard of practice" includes any of the activities engaged in by a "forensic analyst" as those activities are defined in Article, 38.01, Code of Criminal Procedure. "Forensic analyst" means a person who on behalf of a crime laboratory accredited under Article 38.01, Code of Criminal Procedure technically reviews or performs a forensic analysis or draws conclusions from or interprets a forensic analysis for a court or crime laboratory.
- (2) The term "would substantially affect the integrity of the results of a forensic analysis" does not necessarily require that a criminal case be impacted or a report

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 2(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 2(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.35 § (a)(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See, TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.35 § (a)(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 2(4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.35 § (a)(5).

be issued to a customer in error. The term includes acts or omissions that would call into question the integrity of the forensic analysis, the forensic analyst or analysts or the crime laboratory as a whole regardless of the ultimate outcome in the underlying criminal case.

### 2.0 Membership

- (a) The FSC is composed of nine members, appointed by the governor as follows:
  - (1) two members must have expertise in the field of forensic science;
  - (2) one must be a prosecuting attorney that the governor selects from a list of 10 names submitted by the Texas District and County Attorneys Association;
  - (3) one must be a defense attorney that the governor selects from a list of 10 names submitted by the Texas Criminal Defense Lawyers Association;
  - (4) one must be a faculty member or staff member of The University of Texas who specializes in clinical laboratory medicine selected from a list of 5 names submitted to the governor by the chancellor of The University of Texas System;
  - (5) one must be a faculty member or staff member of Texas A&M University who specializes in clinical laboratory medicine selected from a list of 5 names submitted to the governor by the chancellor of The Texas A&M University System;
  - (6) one must be a faculty member or staff member of Texas Southern University selected from a list of 5 names submitted to the governor by the chancellor of Texas Southern University;
  - (7) one must be a director or division head of the University of North Texas Health Science Center at Fort Worth Missing Persons DNA Database; and
  - (8) one must be a faculty or staff member of the Sam Houston State University College of Criminal Justice and have expertise in the field of forensic science selected from a list of 5 names submitted to the governor by the chancellor of Texas State University System.<sup>12</sup>
- **(b)** Each member of the FSC serves a staggered two-year term subject to reappointment. Members are appointed to terms beginning on September 1<sup>st</sup>. The term of the members appointed under Sections (1)-(6) above expire on September 1 of each odd-numbered year. The term of the members appointed under Sections (7)-(8) above expire on September 1 of each even-numbered year. <sup>13</sup>
- **(c)** The Governor designates a presiding officer ("Chair"). The Chair may nominate other officers including a vice-chair and committee chairs, subject to the approval of other Commission members.<sup>14</sup>
- (d) The names and terms of the members shall be listed on the FSC website at www.fsc.state.tx.us.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 3(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 3(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 3(c).

- **(e)** A person who is appointed to and qualifies for office as a member of the FSC shall receive an orientation from the Chair and staff that provides the person with information regarding:
  - (1) the legislation that created the FSC and related laws;
  - (2) the policies and procedures of the FSC, as described in this document and any associated documents generated by the FSC or staff;
  - (3) the current budget for the FSC;
  - (4) the requirements of:
    - (A) The Open Meeting Act, Government Code Chapter 551;
    - (B) The Public Information Act, Government Code Chapter 552;
    - (C) other laws relating to public officials, including conflict of interest laws;
  - (5) the minutes of the meetings of the FSC; and
  - (6) any pending complaints, disclosures or ongoing investigations.

#### 2.1 Meetings

- (a) The FSC shall hold at least quarterly meetings and additional meetings at the call of the Chair. The Chair of the FSC shall conduct FSC meetings and may designate the dates, times and places of meetings following consultation with Commission members. The Vice Chair shall conduct FSC meetings in the Chair's absence.
- **(b)** Notice of the meeting and the meeting agenda shall be made available to the FSC members, advisory members, and other interested parties in advance of each FSC meeting and shall be posted with the Office of Secretary of the State and on the FSC meeting webpage.
- **(c)** A quorum of the FSC is five members. A quorum is required for formal action by the FSC. Formal action may be approved by a majority vote of the members present and voting.
- (d) The Chair shall establish the agenda for each meeting after consultation with the full FSC and staff.
- **(e)** To increase public access, the Commission will endeavor to live-stream all of its quarterly meetings on its website at <a href="www.fsc.state.tx.us">www.fsc.state.tx.us</a>. Decisions to live-stream any particular meeting do not guarantee all meetings will be live-streamed. The ability to live-stream depends on budgetary constraints and logistical factors at any given meeting.

### 2.2 Committees

- (a) The FSC shall have three standing committees: Complaint and Disclosure Screening, Forensic Development, and Legislative. The FSC Chair shall nominate three members of the FSC for each standing committee, subject to the approval of the full FSC. Each committee shall elect a member to serve as chair of the committee. The FSC Chair also may form additional committees, panels or workgroups as needed.
- **(b)** A quorum of a committee is two members, and a quorum is required for a committee to meet and take action. The actions of any committee are not final and serve only as recommendations to the full FSC.

- **(c)** Because complaints reviewed by the Complaint and Disclosure Screening Committee are of inherent interest to the public, the Committee shall hold all of its meetings as open public meetings. The notice rules set forth under the Open Meetings Act shall be used for these meetings.
- (d) The FSC may, by majority vote of a quorum of its members, elect a member of the Texas Association of Crime Laboratory Directors (TACLD) to serve as a non-voting member of the Forensic Development Committee. The TACLD member shall remain a member of the Committee until he or she requests removal or until a majority of the FSC votes to remove him or her.

### 3.0 Processing of Complaints and Laboratory Self-Disclosures

- (a) The FSC shall approve forms for complaints and laboratory self-disclosures and make them available on the FSC website. As further described below, complaints and disclosures are initially reviewed by the Complaint and Disclosure Screening Committee, approved for investigation by the full FSC, investigated through an Investigation Panel, which may include outsourced investigative resources, and completed in the form of a report adopted by the full FSC.
- **(b)** Complaints and disclosures shall be considered initially through the Complaint and Disclosure Screening Committee. The chair of the Committee shall present the complaints and disclosures before the FSC with a recommendation for disposition. The Committee may recommend the following dispositions:
  - (1) dismiss the complaint or disclosure;
  - (2) accept the complaint or disclosure and submit for action by an Investigation Panel;
  - (3) recommend the FSC use its discretion to review the matter for educational purposes;
  - (4) recommend no further action by the laboratory is necessary at this time; or
  - (5) take such other action as appropriate.
- **(c)** The Complaint and Disclosure Screening Committee may assign staff to collect preliminary information related to a complaint or disclosure, including research into the status of any underlying criminal or civil case and whether the complaint or disclosure addresses a forensic analysis subject to investigation by the FSC. In addition, an actor named in a complaint or disclosure and the involved accredited laboratory, facility or entity may be given an opportunity but is not required to provide a written reply, offering any reasons for or against accepting the complaint or designating the disclosure for investigation. The following factors may be considered when a complaint or disclosure is screened by the Committee and considered by the FSC:
  - (1) whether the FSC has jurisdiction;
  - (2) the availability of the person who was the defendant in the criminal action associated with the forensic evidence;
  - (4) the availability of any actor who conducted any part of the forensic analysis;
  - (5) the length of time between the forensic analysis and the complaint or disclosure;

- (6) the availability of records in connection with the forensic analysis and any associated litigation;
- (7) the status of any criminal case or civil litigation associated with the forensic analysis;
- (8) the potential for additional relevant forensic analysis;
- (9) any other factor that would enhance or detract from a complete and accurate investigation of the forensic analysis and any alleged negligence or misconduct;
- (10) the availability of funds to complete an investigation; and
- (11) the opportunity for the investigation and report to educate the forensic science community, advance the standards and training associated with such a forensic analysis or identify legislative recommendations for strengthening a field of forensic science.
- **(d)** Upon reaching a recommended initial disposition for a complaint or disclosure, the Committee shall provide a summary of the recommendation to the Commission.
- **(e)** Following action by the full FSC regarding the disposition of a complaint or disclosure, the FSC shall notify the complainant, actor involved in the forensic analysis and the laboratory, facility or entity of the disposition.
- **(f)** To ensure thorough consideration of all complaints and self-disclosures, complainants and laboratories submitting disclosures should make such submissions at least fifteen (15) business days before a particular quarterly Commission meeting to have the complaint or disclosure considered at that meeting. The Commission reserves the right to consider any complaint or disclosure that does not meet the 15-day deadline at the next quarterly meeting.
- **(g)** A member of the Commission may, by formal motion, request that the full Commission reconsider a dismissed complaint or disclosure if the member identifies new evidence of professional negligence or professional misconduct that was not previously considered by the Commission. The new evidence may be derived from either:
  - (1) information in the existing record that the complainant believes was not considered by the Commission previously; or
  - (2) new information brought to the Commission's attention that was not previously considered by the Commission.
- **(h)** A motion described in this section may be made only if the Commissioner believes in good faith that the information will have a material impact on the Commission's analysis of the complaint or disclosure pursuant to the screening criteria set forth in Section 3.0 above.
- (i) After considering the member's motion, the Commission shall vote to:
  - (1) affirm the original decision to dismiss the complaint or disclosure; or
  - (2) re-open the complaint or disclosure.
- (j) The Commission shall notify the complainant and the appropriate laboratory, facility or entity in writing of the results of the Commission's vote under Subsection (h).
- (k) The Commission shall conduct an appropriate investigation of a complaint or disclosure

reopened under Subsection (i)(2).

- (I) The General Counsel may dismiss complaints related to the portion of an autopsy conducted by a medical examiner or licensed physician as falling outside the Commission's statutory jurisdiction without bringing the complaint before the Complaint Screening Committee or full FSC for consideration.
- (m) The General Counsel may refer complaints and requests involving DNA mixtures to the statewide DNA Mixture Review Team or other responsible entity without bringing the complaints and requests before the Complaint Screening Committee or full FSC for consideration. The General Counsel shall provide the total number of complaints and inquiries referred to the statewide DNA Mixture Review Team to the full Comission at each quarterly meeting during which such referrals are made.
- (n) The General Counsel may dismiss complaints not related to an examination or test on physical evidence, because such complaints fall outside the Commission's jurisdiction as they are not "forensic analysis" complaints as defined by Article 38.35, Code of Criminal Procedure.
- (o) Any Commission member has a right to reopen cases falling under paragraphs (l), (m) or (n) above. Commission staff shall maintain a list of the complaints dismissed under paragraphs (l), (m) and (n).

#### 4.0 Investigation Panels

- (a) After the full Commission votes to conduct an investigation, the Chair shall nominate at least three Commission members to an Investigation Panel ("Panel") subject to the approval of the full Commission. The Panel shall elect one member as chair of the Panel.
- **(b)** After a complaint or self-disclosure is designated for investigation and assigned a Panel by the Commission, the complainant, actor involved in the forensic analysis and the laboratory, facility or entity may provide any information to the Commission that may assist the Commission in its investigation, including information that will assist the Commission in making a finding regarding professional negligence and/or misconduct.
- **(c)** A Panel shall coordinate any information gathering for complaints and self-disclosures designated for investigation by the Commission. The Panel shall specify the focus of the investigation, communicate with the entities or individuals involved in the investigation, and collect any appropriate records. The Panel may initiate contact with any governmental agency, individual or entity that may have an interest in or relevant information regarding an investigation. The Panel may:
  - (1) collect and review documents and data as necessary;
  - (2) conduct interviews with individuals as needed;
  - (3) issue notification of results or refer the case to a governmental or other relevant agency or accrediting body, pursuant to a written communication, memorandum of understanding or other agreement between the agencies;
  - (4) contract with a subject matter expert if needed;<sup>15</sup>
  - (5) make recommendations to the Commission regarding the presence or absence of professional negligence or misconduct, and other observations and recommendations as permitted by law; or

-

 $<sup>^{15}</sup>$  Tex. Code Crim. Proc. art. 38.01  $\S$  4(c).

- (6) take such other action as appropriate and necessary for the Commission to fulfill its investigative responsibilities.
- (d) If the FSC votes to investigate a complaint or self-disclosure, the Panel shall coordinate the completion of the investigation and draft a written report pursuant to Section 1.1(b), including a recommendation for final disposition to the full FSC. The Panel may delegate preparation of the initial report draft to Commission staff. An investigative report or recommendation is not final and does not represent the conclusions of the FSC until a final report is adopted and issued by the full FSC. Following consideration of the recommendation for final disposition from the Panel, the Commission shall issue a report using the criteria set forth in its enabling statute.

For investigations <u>involving accredited crime laboratories and accredited forensic</u> disciplines only, the FSC may:

- (1) find there is insufficient information to conclude that professional negligence or professional misconduct occurred in the forensic analysis;
- (2) find there is sufficient information to conclude that professional negligence or professional misconduct occurred in the forensic analysis;
- (3) require retrospective re-examination of evidence as appropriate;
- (4) require corrective action and follow-up as appropriate.

For all Commission investigations, regardless of whether they involve accredited crime laboratories or accredited forensic disciplines, the Commission's report may:

- (1) make observations regarding the integrity and reliability of the forensic analysis conducted;
- (2) identify applicable best practices; and
- (3) make other relevant recommendations.
- **(e)** Any finding by the Commission is not a comment upon the guilt or innocence of any individual and is not necessarily a basis for relief in litigation or in any other forum. Reports of the Commission are not admissible in a civil or criminal action.<sup>16</sup>
- **(f)** The FSC shall make the final report available to the public<sup>17</sup> on the FSC website and provide a copy, as applicable, to the:
  - (1) prosecutor, judge, defendant and defense attorney involved in the underlying criminal case, if any;
  - (2) Board of Pardons and Paroles;
  - (3) Director of the Department of Public Safety;
  - (4) Governor;
  - (5) Lieutenant Governor:
  - (6) Speaker of the House of Representatives;
  - (7) Complainant; and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(g)..

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(e).

- (8) Actor(s) and accredited laboratory, facility or entity involved in any part of the forensic analysis. 18
- **(g)** FSC Investigation Panels may meet by telephone for information gathering purposes only. All deliberative discussions by Panels shall be held in open, public meetings in accordance with the Texas Open Meetings Act or other applicable law.

### 5.0 Forensic Analyst Licensing

- (a) The Commission by rule may establish classifications of forensic analyst licenses if the Commission determines that it is necessary to ensure the availability of properly trained and qualified forensic analysts to perform activities regulated by the Commission.<sup>19</sup>
- **(b)** Effective January 1, 2019, a person may not act or offer to act as a forensic analyst unless the person holds a forensic analyst license.<sup>20</sup>
- **(c)** The Commission by rule may establish voluntary licensing programs for forensic disciplines that are not subject to accreditation by the Commission.<sup>21</sup>
- **(d)** The Commission by rule shall:
  - (1) establish the qualifications for a license that include:
    - (A) successful completion of the education requirements established by the Commission;
    - (B) specific coursework and experience, including instruction in courtroom testimony and ethics in a crime laboratory;
    - (C) successful completion of an examination required or recognized by the Commission; and
    - (D) successful completion of proficiency testing to the extent required by the crime laboratory's accrediting body;
  - (2) set fees for the issuance and renewal of a license; and
  - (3) establish the term of a forensic analyst license.<sup>22</sup>
- (e) The Commission may by rule recognize a certification issued by a national organization in an accredited field of forensic science as satisfying the requirements established under 5.0 (a) to the extent the Commission determines the content required to receive the certification is substantially equivalent to the content of the requirements under 5.0 (a).<sup>23</sup>
- **(f)** The Commission shall issue a license to an applicant who:
  - (1) submits an application on a form prescribed by the Commission;
  - (2) meets the qualifications established by Commission rule; and
  - (3) pays the required fee.<sup>24</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(c).

 $<sup>^{22}</sup>$  Tex. Code Crim. Proc. art. 38.01  $\S$  4-a(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-a(f).

### **5.1 Advisory Committee**

- (a) The Commission shall establish an advisory committee to advise the Commission and make recommendations on matters related to the licensing of forensic analysts under 5.0.<sup>25</sup>
- **(b)** The advisory committee consists of nine members as follows:
  - (1) one prosecuting attorney recommended by the Texas District and County Attorneys Association;
  - (2) one defense attorney recommended by the Texas Criminal Defense Lawyers Association; and
  - (3) seven members who are forensic scientists, crime laboratory directors, or crime laboratory quality managers, selected by the Commission from a list of 20 names submitted by the Texas Association of Crime Laboratory Directors.<sup>26</sup>
- **(c)** The Commission shall ensure that appointments under 5.1(b) include representation from municipal, county, state and private crime laboratories that are accredited by the Commission <sup>27</sup>
- **(d)** The advisory committee members serve staggered two-year terms, with the terms of four or five members, as appropriate, expiring on August 31 of each year. An advisory committee member may not serve more than two consecutive terms. A vacancy on the advisory committee is filled by appointing a member in the same manner as the original appointment to serve for the unexpired portion of the term.<sup>28</sup>
- **(e)** The advisory committee shall elect a presiding officer from among its members to serve a one-year term. A member may serve more than one term as presiding officer.<sup>29</sup>
- **(f)** The advisory committee shall meet annually and at the call of the presiding officer or the Commission.<sup>30</sup>
- **(g)** An advisory committee member is not entitled to compensation. A member is entitled to reimbursement for actual and necessary expenses incurred in performing duties as a member of the advisory committee subject to the General Appropriations Act.<sup>31</sup>
- **(h)** All advisory committee meetings shall be held open to the public in compliance with the Open Meetings Act.<sup>32</sup>

### 5.2 Disciplinary Action

- (a) On a determination by the Commission that a license holder or applicant for a license has committed professional misconduct or violated an administrative rule or order of the Commission, the Commission may:
  - (1) revoke or suspend the person's license;
  - (2) refuse to renew the person's license; or

 $<sup>^{25}</sup>$  Tex. Code Crim. Proc. art. 38.01  $\S$  4-b(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(g).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-b(h).

- (3) reprimand the license holder; or
- (4) deny the person a license.<sup>33</sup>
- **(b)** The Commission may place on probation a person whose license is suspended. If a license suspension is probated, the Commission may require the license holder to:
  - (1) report regularly to the Commission on matters that are the basis of the probation; or
  - (2) continue or review continuing professional education until the license holder attains a degree of skill satisfactory to the Commission in those areas that are the basis of the probation.<sup>34</sup>
- **(c)** All disciplinary proceedings of the Commission are governed by Chapter 2001 of the Texas Government Code. A hearing under Section 5.0 shall be conducted by an administrative law judge of the State Office of Administrative Hearings.<sup>35</sup>

### 6.0 Crime Laboratory Accreditation Process

- (a) The Commission by rule:
  - (1) shall establish an accreditation process for crime laboratories and other entities conducting forensic analyses of physical evidence for use in criminal proceedings; and
  - (2) may modify or remove a crime laboratory exemption if the Commission determines that the underlying reason for the exemption no longer applies.<sup>36</sup>
- **(b)** As part of the accreditation process established and implemented under this Section, the Commission may:
  - (1) establish minimum standards that relate to the timely production of forensic analysis to the agency requesting the analysis and that are consistent with the Commissions enabling statute and applicable laws.
  - (2) validate or approve specific forensic methods or methodologies; and
  - (3) establish procedures, policies, and practices to improve the quality of forensic analyses conducted in Texas.<sup>37</sup>
- **(c)** The Commission may require that a laboratory, facility or entity required to be accredited by the Commission pay any costs incurred to ensure compliance with the accreditation process.<sup>38</sup>
- (d) A laboratory, facility or entity that must be accredited by the Commission shall, as part of the accreditation process, agree to consent to any request for cooperation by the Commission that is made as part of the exercise of the Commission's duties under this Section.<sup>39</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-c(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-c(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-c(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(b-1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(b-2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(b-3).

- **(e)** The Commission may by rule exempt from the accreditation process a crime laboratory conducting a forensic analysis or type of analysis, examination, or test if the Commission determines that:
  - (1) independent accreditation is unavailable or inappropriate for the laboratory or the type of analysis, examination, or test performed by the laboratory;
  - (2) the type of analysis, examination, or test performed by the laboratory is admissible under a well-established rule of evidence or a statute other than Article 38.35;
  - (3) the type of analysis, examination, or test performed by the laboratory is routinely conducted outside of a crime laboratory by a person other than an employee of the crime laboratory; or
  - (4) the laboratory:
    - (a) is located outside Texas or, if located in Texas, is operated by a governmental entity other than the state or a political subdivision of the state; and
    - (b) was accredited at the time of the analysis under an accreditation process with standards that meet or exceed the relevant standards of the process established under Section 6.0 (b).<sup>40</sup>
- **(f)** The Commission may at any reasonable time enter and inspect the premises or audit the records, reports, procedures, or other quality assurance matters of a crime laboratory that is accredited or seeking accreditation.<sup>41</sup>
- **(g)** The Commission may collect costs incurred for accrediting, inspecting, or auditing a crime laboratory.<sup>42</sup>
- **(h)** If the Commission provides a copy of an audit or other report made under this Section, the Commission may charge \$6 for the copy, in additional to any other cost permitted under Chapter 552, Government Code, or a rule adopted under that chapter.<sup>43</sup>
- (i) Rules promulgated under the Commission's accreditation authority described in this subsection are published in the Texas Administrative Code, Chapter 651.<sup>44</sup>
- **(j)** To maintain accreditation by the Commission, Laboratories shall provide the Commission with a copy of correspondence and each report or communication between the laboratory and the recognized accrediting body. The laboratory shall submit the copy to the Commission no later than 30 days after the date the laboratory receives or transmits the correspondence, report, or communication. *See* Policies and Procedures Appendix A for guidance related to reporting requirements.<sup>45</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(c).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4-d(f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Tex. Admin. Code, 37 ch. 651.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Tex. Admin. Code 37 ch. 651.8 (d)(2).

### 7.0 Rio Grande Identification Project

The Commission shall work with stakeholders to establish a method for collecting DNA and other forensic evidence related to unidentified bodies located less than 120 miles from the Rio Grande River in Texas.<sup>46</sup>

### 8.0 Forensic Development Committee

The Forensic Development Committee shall develop, subject to the approval of the full FSC, plans to strengthen the use of scientifically reliable forensic science in criminal courts in Texas. Such plans may include collection and dissemination of funding opportunities for the advancement of forensic science, support for training and the development of professional standards and the collection of information that supports programs for strengthening forensic science.

# 9.0 Legislative Committee

The Legislative Committee shall study the ongoing work of the FSC and be prepared to monitor legislation and testify when requested on the application of statutes within the purview of the FSC. The committee shall also review and recommend a legislative appropriations request to the full FSC and monitor the appropriations process as it affects the FSC.

#### 10.0 Records

- (a) All investigations shall be assigned a unique number to be used for subsequent documentation in that matter. Mere receipt of a complaint or disclosure does not imply any opinion by the FSC as to the merits of the allegations in the complaint or issues raised in the disclosure.
- **(b)** FSC records shall be centralized and organized by staff for simplicity of access and ease of response to open records requests. To the extent feasible, records should be digitized and stored electronically.

#### 11.0 Open Records Requests/Rule 12 - Rules of Judicial Administration

- (a) The Commission shall comply with Rule 12 of the Rules of Judicial Administration in providing the public access to records held by the Commission.<sup>47</sup>
- **(b)** Rule 12 applies to records in practically any medium and includes the following: a document, paper, letter, map, book, tape, photograph, film, recording, or other material, regardless of electronic or physical form, characteristics, or means of transmission.

Information may be considered public and subject to disclosure under Rule 12 even when it is sent from a personal email account or personal mobile device. *If the information concerns Commission business, it is public information under Rule 12 regardless of where it is stored.* 

(c) The Commission's designated Records Custodian is:

M. Kathryn Adams 1700 North Congress Ave., Suite 445 Austin, Texas 78701 (512) 936-0770

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> See Appendix B, Rule 12 of the Rules of Judicial Administration.

- (d) The FSC accepts written records requests via facsimile to (512) 936-7986, by email to <a href="mailto:info@fsc.texas.gov">info@fsc.texas.gov</a>, or by regular mail to the Commission office at 1700 North Congress Avenue, Suite 445, Austin, TX 78701.
- **(e)** If the cost to provide public information exceeds \$40, the FSC may charge for personnel time, overhead, and postage. The FSC tries to waive and minimize fees where doing so is in the public interest and where the cost of processing collection of a charge will exceed the amount of the charge. However, a decision to waive a fee for one request does not necessarily mean the fee will be waived for a future request. A person who believes that a charge for a copy of a record is excessive may appeal the overcharge in the manner prescribed by Rule 12.9 for the appeal of the denial of access to a judicial record.<sup>48</sup>
- **(f)** Information filed as part of an allegation of professional misconduct or professional negligence or that is obtained during an investigation of an allegation of professional negligence or professional misconduct is not subject to release until the conclusion of an investigation by the FSC.<sup>49</sup>

# 12.0 Budget

The FSC shall adopt an operating budget each fiscal year. The Chair shall approve expenditures recommended by the General Counsel in between meetings that are not specified within the budget. A revised budget to reflect such expenditures shall be included for review in the next quarterly meeting's materials.

#### 13.0 Administrative Attachment to Office of Court Administration

- (a) Commission staff are employees of the Office of Court Administration ("OCA"), but operate under the supervision of the Chair of the FSC. Staff includes a General Counsel, Commission Coordinator, Associate General Counsel, Senior Scientific Advisor and any other such staff necessary to complete the duties of the FSC. The duties of staff shall be summarized in separate job descriptions.
- **(b)** The OCA may contract for goods and services on behalf of FSC. The Commission General Counsel, Associate General Counsel and the FSC Chair jointly monitor contract activities that are engaged for FSC.
- **(c)** The Office of Court Administration shall provide administrative support to the Commission as necessary to carry out the purposes of this article.<sup>50</sup>
- **(d)** Only the Commission may exercise the duties of the Commission. The Office of Court Administration has no authority or responsibility with respect to the duties of the Commission.<sup>51</sup>

### 14.0 Additional Assistance

(a) As needed, the FSC shall seek the assistance of the Texas Legislative Council, the Legislative Budget Board, and the University of Texas at Austin.<sup>52</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> See Appendix B, Rule 12 of the Rules of Judicial Administration.

<sup>49</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 6.

- **(b)** As needed, the FSC may delegate the duties related to developing and implementing the reporting system described in 1.1(a)(1) to any person the FSC determines to be qualified to assume those duties.<sup>53</sup>
- (c) The FSC shall develop a memorandum of understanding or other appropriate agreement with each assisting entity or person.

#### 15.0 Public Comment

- (a) The FSC shall include "public comment" as a topic on the agenda for each regularly scheduled meeting of the full FSC. The FSC reserves the right to eliminate, reduce or postpone the public comment period if deemed necessary due to time constraints or other exigent circumstances.
- **(b)** During the public comment period, any member of the public, subject to the restrictions of this policy, may address the Commission regarding any matter related to the business of the Commission. Persons who attend or participate in the Commission meeting are expected to act in a manner that is respectful of the conduct of public business and conducive to orderly and polite public discourse. Public comment will typically occur at the end of the FSC meeting.
- **(c)** Members of the public shall complete a public participation form before the FSC meeting and deliver the form to the Commission Coordinator.
- (d) Each speaker shall generally be provided three minutes to present public comment. The Commission reserves the right to expand or reduce the time allotted to each speaker and/or to set an overall time limit for the public comment period, depending upon the particular circumstances and requirements of each meeting.
- **(e)** Pursuant to Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code, relating to open meetings, the Commission may respond to an inquiry regarding a subject not listed on the agenda only with:
  - (1) a statement of specific factual information in response to the inquiry; or
  - (2) a recitation of existing policy in response to the inquiry.

Any deliberation or decision about a subject not listed on the agenda must be limited to a proposal to place the subject on the agenda for a subsequent meeting.

**(f)** Members of the public are encouraged to submit written comments to the FSC at any time.

### **16.0 Communications Policy**

#### (a) Legislative Hearings

- (1) An employee who attends or testifies at any public hearing shall obtain advance authorization from the FSC Chair and notify the Legislative Committee.
- (2) Commission members shall notify the Commission Coordinator regarding any hearing at which they intend to testify in their capacity as a member of the FSC.

#### (b) Media

(1) To the extent feasible, Commission members shall inform the General Counsel of all FSC-related media inquiries for interviews, so that the inquiries may be properly organized, recorded and assigned for reply. Commission members may inform the media of this policy and direct media inquiries to the General Counsel.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 4(c).

(2) Commission members and employees shall avoid discussing the details of pending investigations with the media, except upon final disposition of those investigations.

# 17.0 Conflicts Policy

- (1) Any member of the FSC who has a personal or private interest in a matter pending before the FSC shall publicly disclose the fact to the FSC during an open meeting. The Commissioner may not vote or otherwise participate in the matter in which he or she has an interest. The disclosure shall be entered in the minutes of the meeting.
- (2) In this section, "personal or private interest" has the same meaning as is given to it under Article III, Section 22, of the Texas Constitution governing the conduct of members of the Texas Legislature.
- (3) The scope of the term "public or private interest" has not been clearly defined under either the constitutional provision or the Government Code section. Therefore, the question of whether a member has a personal or private interest in a matter pending before the FSC is a fact question to be analyzed on a case-by-case basis. Any questions should be brought to the attention of the FSC General Counsel, who may in turn consult the Texas Ethics Commission and/or the Texas Attorney General as appropriate.
- (4) For purposes of this section, an individual does not have a "personal or private interest" in a measure, proposal, or decision if the individual is engaged in a profession, trade, or occupation and the individual's interest is the same as all others similarly engaged in the profession, trade, or occupation.

### 18.0 Annual Report

The Commission will release an annual report by December 1 each year in accordance with the requirements of its enabling statute.<sup>54</sup>

#### 19.0 Commission Office Contact Information

M. Kathryn Adams, Commission Coordinator Texas Forensic Science Commission 1700 North Congress Avenue Suite 445 Austin, TX 78701

Phone: 1-512-936-0770 Fax: 1-512-936-7986

E-mail: <u>info@fsc.texas.gov</u>
Website: <u>www.fsc.texas.gov</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> TEX. CODE CRIM. PROC. art. 38.01 § 8.